

CONTENTS

<i>Preface</i>	<i>iii</i>
<i>Table of Cases</i>	<i>xxv</i>

Chapter-1 INTRODUCTION

The Origins and Development of the Death Penalty	1
History	2
Execution of Death Sentence in India	7
On Execution Methods	7
Abolition of Capital Punishment	9
Procedure which has to be followed before the execution of the death sentence	10
Bharatiya Nagarik Suraksha Sanhita (BNSS), 2023 & Death Penalty	10
Passing of Death Sentence	11
Confirmation of Death Sentence	12
Execution of Death Sentence	13
Suspension, Remission and Commutation of Death Sentence	14
Directions to State Governments and Union Territories	15
Guidelines for Sessions Courts	16
Types of cases in which death penalty should be awarded instead of life imprisonment	17
International Legal Standard: Towards Abolition	19
Observations of Law Commission of India, 1967	19
Royal Commission Report	20
35th Report of the Law Commission	20
Idea of Death by Electric Chair in India	21
United Nations Call on Death Penalty	22
Safeguards Regarding Capital Punishment in International Law	22
The United Nations' Economic and Social Council (ECOSOC) Safeguards	22
Two subsequent resolutions introduced additional safeguards	23
What are the Realistic Alternatives to the Death Penalty?	24

Chapter-2**PARDONING POWER UNDER THE INDIAN CONSTITUTION**

Constitutional provisions regarding Clemency	27
Judicial Response on Clemency	29
Clemency in recent times	32
Purpose of clemency power:	33

Chapter-3**RAREST OF RARE DOCTRINE****Chapter-4****JUDICIARY AND DEATH PENALTY**

Challenge to the Constitutionality of Capital Punishment.....	43
Judiciary's Role in the Death Penalty in India	46
JUDGMENT-1	46
Society Needs To Be Protected': Calcutta High Court Imposes 40 Year Sentence On "Gurudev" Convicted Of Murder, Commutes Death Penalty	46
Facts of the case	46
Issues Raised	47
Contentions by Petitioners (Prosecution)	47
Contentions by Respondents (Accused)	47
Judgement of Court	48
Trilogy of Judgments and Guidelines Issued	48
Rationale	48
Interferences and Analysis.....	49
Conclusion	49
JUDGMENT-2	49
Sentence Hearing Not Mere Formality, High Court Expresses Concern Over Conviction & Imposition Of Death Penalty On Same Day.....	49
Facts in Nutshell.....	49
Grounds for Appeal / Special Reference.....	50
Issues Raised	50
Contentions by Petitioners (Accused/Appellants)	51
Contentions by Respondent (State of Odisha)	52
Decision of the Court.....	53
Trilogy of Judgments: Guidelines Issued	54
Rationale.....	54

Inference and Analysis	54
Critical Analysis	55
JUDGMENT-3	56
Introduction	56
JUDGMENT-4	67
Chhattisgarh High Court Commutes Death Sentence Of Man For Rape & Murder Of 7-year Old	67
Facts in nutshell.....	67
Questions of law or issues raised.....	68
Contentions raised by Accused/ Appellant.....	68
Contentions raised by State	69
Decision by Court	70
Critical Analysis	71
JUDGMENT-5	73
Facts of the case	73
Question of law	73
Arguments of the Petitioner (State of Maharashtra).....	74
Arguments of the Respondent (The Convict).....	74
Judgment/Decision of the Court.....	75
Critical Analysis	75
Conclusion	76
JUDGMENT-6	76
Facts of the Case	76
The Failure on Reliability.....	80
The Failure on Corroboration.....	80
Critical Analysis	81
Errors in the Trial Court's Approach	81
Evidentiary Weaknesses in the Prosecution's Case	82
Constitutional Significance	82
JUDGMENT-7	83
High Court Acquits Two Death Row Convicts In Triple Murder Case	83
Facts in Nutshell.....	83
Question(s) of Law	83
Arguments by the Petitioner (State of Odisha / Respondent-State)	84
Arguments by the Respondents (Appellants / Defence).....	84
Decision by the Court.....	85

Critical Analysis	85
Legal Principles Affirmed	85
JUDGMENT-8	86
Kerala High Court Alters Murder Conviction Of Ex-CPI(M) Leader Who Was Sentenced To Death.....	86
Facts.....	86
Arguments by the Petitioner (State)	88
Arguments advanced by the Respondents (Accused).....	88
Decision by the Court.....	89
Critical Analysis	90
JUDGMENT-9	91
High Court Upholds Death Sentence in Triple Murder Case	91
Facts of the Case	91
Questions of Law	92
Arguments by the Petitioner (Appellant).....	93
Arguments by the Respondent (State)	93
Decision by the Court.....	94
Critical Analysis	95
JUDGMENT-10	96
Death Penalty Must Be Commuted If Inordinate Delay In Execution Is Caused By Circumstances Beyond Convict's Control	96
Facts in a Nutshell.....	96
ISSUES RAISED.....	97
Contentions of the Appellants.....	97
Contentions of the Respondents	98
Decision by Court	98
Guidelines Issued.....	99
JUDGMENT-11	100
High Court Commutes Death Sentence Of Man For Murdering 3 & 7 Year Old Nephews, Imposes 30 Yearr Rigorous Imprisonment Sentence.....	100
Facts in a nutshell.....	100
Issues Raised	101
Arguments By Petitioner (State of Kerala)	102
Arguments given by Respondent (Thomas Chako @ Shibu).....	103
JUDGEMENT	103
Critical analysis and Conclusion	105

JUDGMENT-12	105
Additional Evidence Of Witness Can Be Recorded At Stage Of Death Reference If Needed For Arriving At Just Conclusion	105
Facts in nutshell.....	105
Issues before the High Court	107
Contentions raised by the State of Odisha	107
Contentions raised by DengunSabar and Ors.	108
Judgement of the High Court.....	108
Rationale.....	109
JUDGMENT-13	110
High Court Confirms Death Sentence of Man Who Killed Wife, Minor Children With Chopper	110
Introduction	110
Facts of the Case.....	110
Questions of Law	111
Arguments by the Petitioner	111
Arguments by the Respondent	112
Judgment of the Court.....	113
Critical Analysis	114
Conclusion	116
JUDGMENT-14	117
Supreme Court Upholds Acquittal in Murder Case Based on Circumstantial Evidence.....	117
Facts in nutshell.....	117
Issues Raised	118
Contentions raised by Petitioners (State of Madhya Pradesh)	118
Contentions raised by Respondents (Accused)	118
Judgment of the Supreme Court.....	118
Conclusion	119
JUDGMENT-15	119
Facts.....	119
Question of Law	120
Arguments by Petitioner (Appellant)	120
Arguments by Respondent (State of Rajasthan).....	121
Conclusion	124

JUDGMENT-16	125
Supreme Court Commutes Death Sentence of Man Convicted of Rape & Murder of 11 Year Old Girl	125
Facts of the case:	125
Issues in the Case	128
Decision of the Supreme Court	130
JUDGMENT-17	131
High Court Commutes Death Sentence Of Man Who Burnt Alive Woman, 2 Year Old; Awards Life Sentence	131
Facts in nutshell	131
Case analysis	132
Facts	133
Question of Law	133
Arguments by Petitioner	134
Arguments by Respondent	135
Decision by Court	137
JUDGMENT-18	138
High Court Confirms Conviction and Commutation of Death Sentence to Life Imprisonment in Case of Rape and Murder of Minor	138
Facts in nutshell	138
Issues Raised	138
Contentions raised by Petitioners	139
Contentions raised by Respondents	139
Judgment of the High Court	139
Rationale	140
Critical Analysis	141
JUDGMENT-19	142
High Court upholds Death Sentence For Child Rapist	142
Facts in Nutshell	142
Procedural History	143
Arguments by Appellants	143
Arguments by Respondent	144
Decision of the Court	145
JUDGMENT-20	145
Death Sentence in the American Center attack case Commuted by the Supreme Court	145
Facts	145

Question of Law	147
Arguments by the Petitioner (Appellants: Nasir & Aftab)	147
Arguments by the Respondent (State/Prosecution).....	148
Decision of the Court.....	148
Grounds for Special Leave to Appeal	149
Trilogy of Judgments / Guidelines Applied.....	149
Critical Analysis	149
JUDGMENT-21	150
“Every Sinner Has A Future”: Supreme Court Commutes Death Sentence Imposed On Man For Rape & Murder Of 4 Year Old Girl	150
FACTS IN NUTSHELL.....	150
ISSUE RAISED.....	150
Arguments on behalf of the Petitioner (Navneet Kaur).....	151
Arguments advanced by the Respondent (State/Union of India).....	151
Judgment of the Court.....	151
Critical Analysis	152
JUDGMENT-22	152
The State’s power to take life, though constitutionally recognized, must be exercised through procedures	152
Facts.....	152
Question of Law	154
Arguments by Petitioner.....	154
Arguments by Respondent.....	155
Decision by Court	156
Critical Analysis	158
Strengths of the Judgment:	158
Areas of Concern:.....	158
Broader Implications:	159
JUDGMENT-23	160
High Court Gives Benefit Of Doubt To Accused, Sets Aside Death Sentence In A Case Of Rape & Double Murder	160
Facts.....	160
Background of the Deceased and the Village Setting	160
Discovery of the Crime.....	160
Initial Police Action.....	160
Investigation and Evidence Collection	161

Prosecution's Narrative.....	161
Trial Court's Conviction.....	161
Defence Position.....	162
Appellate Proceedings.....	162
Question of Law	162
Arguments by the Petitioner (State of Maharashtra).....	162
Arguments by the Respondents (Accused).....	163
Decision by the Court.....	165
Critical Analysis	165
JUDGMENT-24	166
Rape & Murder Of Minor Girl, Karnataka High Court Commutes Death Penalty	166
Grounds for Appeal.....	167
Issues Raised	167
Contentions Raised by Appellant (Accused)	167
Contentions Raised by Respondent (State)	167
Judgment	168
Rationale.....	168
Conclusion	168
JUDGMENT-25	169
Abhorrent Nature Of Crime Alone Cannot Be The Decisive Factor For Awarding Death Sentence ; Mitigating Factors Equally Relevant	169
Facts.....	169
Grounds of Special Leave to Appeal.....	169
Issues Raised	170
Contentions by the Petitioner (Pappu).....	171
Arguments of the Respondent (State of U.P.).....	171
Judgment of the Supreme Court.....	172
Conviction	172
Sentence	172
Trilogy of Judgments: Guidelines on Death Penalty	173
Significance	174
Rationale.....	174
JUDGMENT-26	175
Trial Court Must Elicit Information From State & Accused On Mitigating Circumstances : Supreme Court Issues Guidelines	175

Facts in Nutshell.....	175
Question of Law	176
Contentions Raised by Petitioners.....	176
Unreliable Arrest and Recovery.....	176
Test Identification Parade (TIP) Unreliable	177
Procedural Lapses.....	177
Witness Contradictions	178
Sentencing Flawed	178
Contentions Raised by Respondents.....	179
Evidence Conclusive.....	179
TIP Corroborative Only.....	179
Minor Lapses Immaterial.....	179
Death Penalty Justified	180
Decision of the Supreme Court.....	180
Conviction.....	180
Sentencing	181
Guidelines Issued	181
JUDGMENT-27	182
Solitary Confinement for About Ten Years Illegal, Supreme Court Commutes Death Sentence of Ex Cop Accused of Rape & Murder of A Housewife	182
Facts in nutshell.....	182
Issues Raised	183
Contentions Raised by Petitioner	183
Contentions Raised by Respondents.....	184
Judgment of the Supreme Court.....	184
Ratio Decidendi	186
Rationale and Analysis.....	186
JUDGMENT-28	187
Death Sentence Imposed Without Any Shred Of Evidence, Supreme Court Acquits Man Convicted For Alleged Rape & Murder Of Minor Girl	187
Facts in a Nutshell.....	187
Grounds for Appeal.....	188
Issues Raised	190
Contentions of the Petitioner (Appellant)	191
Contentions of the Respondent (State of UP)	192
Judgment of the Supreme Court.....	193

Inference and Analysis	194
JUDGMENT-29	195
Supreme Court Acquits Man Who Was Sentenced to Death for Alleged Murder of Wife, Four Kids	195
Facts.....	195
Question of Law	196
Arguments by petitioner.....	197
Arguments by respondent.....	198
Decision by Court	198
Critical Analysis	199
JUDGMENT-30	201
No Identification Of Accused, Witnesses Not Cross-Examined, Supreme Court Acquits 3 Men Sentenced To Death.....	201
Facts.....	201
Question of Law	201
Arguments by Petitioners	201
Arguments by Respondents	202
Decision by Court	203
Critical Analysis	204
Presumption of Innocence and Burden of Proof	204
Standards for Circumstantial Evidence	204
Investigative Lapses and Their Consequences	205
Scientific Evidence and Its Validation.....	205
Right to Fair Trial	205
Balancing Societal Expectations and Legal Standards.....	205
Systemic Implications.....	206
Conclusion	206
JUDGMENT-31	206
“Hurried & Cryptic Sentence Hearing Is Anathema To Death Penology”, High Court Commutes Death Sentence to Life Imprisonment	206
Facts in nutshell.....	206
Grounds for Special Leave to Appeal	207
Issues Raised	208
Contentions raised by Appellants	208
Contentions Raised by the Appellants.....	208
Contentions raised by the State.....	210

Judgment of the Supreme Court.....	210
Rationale.....	211
Inference and Analysis	211
JUDGMENT-32	211
Death Penalty Is Irreversible Step, Judges Should Never Be ‘Bloodthirsty’	211
Facts of the case	211
Discrepancies in the Case	212
Issues Raised	213
Contentions raised by Petitioners	213
Contentions raised by Respondents.....	214
Judgement by High Court	215
Critical Analysis	216
JUDGMENT-33	217
Supreme Court Remands POCSO Case To Trial Court For Proper Examination Of Scientific Experts Connected With DNA Report; Sets Aside Death Penalty	217
Facts in a nutshell.....	217
Laws Involved	218
Issues Raised	219
Contentions by Petitioners (Appellants/Accused)	219
Contentions by Respondents (State of Madhya Pradesh).....	220
Judgement	221
Rationale.....	222
Inference and Analysis	223
JUDGMENT-34	223
Supreme Court Commutes Death Penalty Of Man Convicted For Rape-Murder Of 10-Year Old Girl To Life Term Without Remission	223
Facts in Nutshell.....	223
Grounds for Special Leave to Appeal	225
Question of Law	226
Arguments by Petitioner (Appellant)	226
Arguments by Respondent (State).....	226
Decision by Court	226
Rationale.....	227
Conclusion	227

JUDGMENT-35	228
Whether awarding death penalty to a 20-year-old offender violated the constitutional principles of proportionality.....	228
Facts in Nutshell.....	228
Grounds For Appeal.....	229
Question Of Law	230
Arguments By Petitioner (Appellant)	230
Arguments By Respondent.....	231
Decisions By Court.....	233
Critical Analysis	234
JUDGMENT-36	236
Even Person Accused Of Heinous Crimes Entitled To Basic Protection Of Law' : Supreme Court Sets Aside Death Penalty For Lack Of Fair Trial.....	236
Facts in a Nutshell.....	236
Grounds of the Appeal.....	236
Issues Raised	238
Contentions Raised by the Petitioner	238
Contentions Raised by the Respondent.....	239
Judgment of the Supreme Court.....	240
Rationale.....	241
Inference and Analysis	242
JUDGMENT-37	243
High Court Commutes Death Sentence Of Man Convicted Of Double Murder, Killing Pregnant Lady's Foetus.....	243
Facts in nutshell.....	243
ISSUES	243
Contentions raised by the appellant	244
Contentions raised by the Respondents	244
Judgement by the High Court.....	245
Reference of Judgements: Guidelines Issued.....	246
Rationale.....	247
JUDGMENT-38	248
Good Conduct For 16-17 Years: Supreme Court Commutes Death Sentence Of Man Convicted For Killing Wife, Children & Raping Daughter	248
Facts.....	248

Procedural History.....	249
Question of Law	249
Arguments by Petitioner.....	249
Arguments by Respondent.....	250
Decision by Supreme Court.....	250
Critical Analysis	251
JUDGMENT-39	251
Death penalty is an exception	251
Facts of the Case	251
Question of Law	252
On Circumstantial Evidence.....	253
On the “Rarest of Rare” Doctrine	253
Arguments by Petitioner (Appellant)	253
On Conviction:.....	254
Arguments by Respondent (State of Uttar Pradesh)	255
Critical Analysis	256
JUDGMENT-40	256
Court Acquits Man Who Was Sentenced To Death For Rape & Murder.....	256
Facts in Nutshell.....	256
Grounds for Appeal / Defense Arguments	257
Issues Raised	257
Contentions Raised by Petitioners (Accused/Appellant).....	258
Contentions Raised by Respondents (Prosecution/State)	258
Judgment of the High Court.....	258
Rationale and Inference.....	259
Conclusion	259
JUDGMENT-41	260
Mere Illegal Entry Without Anti-National Material Not Attempt To Wage War Against India, Calcutta High Court Commutes Death Sentence Of 4 LeT Members	260
Facts in nutshell.....	260
Grounds for Appeal	261
Issues Raised	261
Contentions raised by Petitioners.....	262
Contentions raised by Respondents.....	262
Judgment of the Supreme Court.....	263

Rationale	264
JUDGMENT-42	265
Supreme Court Acquits Man Who Was Sentenced To Death For Alleged Murder Of Wife, Four Kids	265
Facts.....	265
Marriage and Domestic Context.....	265
The First Information Report (FIR) and Initial Scene	265
Police Investigation and Evidence Collection.....	266
Judgment of Sessions Court	267
Appeal to the High Court	267
Supreme Court Appeal.....	267
Questions of Law	267
Primary Legal Issues.....	267
Jurisdictional and Procedural Questions.....	268
Substantive Legal Principles.....	268
Arguments by Petitioner.....	269
Challenge to Circumstantial Evidence Framework	269
Systematic Rejection of Discovery Evidence.....	269
Challenge to Extra-Judicial Confessions.....	269
Insufficient Proof of Motive.....	270
Prosecution's Failure to Explain Injuries.....	270
Inadequacy of Remaining Evidence.....	270
Arguments by Respondent.....	271
Defense of Concurrent Findings.....	271
Support for Extra-Judicial Confessions.....	271
Justification of Discovery Evidence.....	271
Establishment of Strong Motive.....	272
Interpretation of Accused's Conduct	272
Challenge to Defense Version.....	272
Argument on Limited Appellate Scope.....	272
Supreme Court's Analysis and Decision	273
Systematic Rejection of Prosecution Evidence.....	273
Discovery Evidence Under Section 27 [under section 23 of BSA]	273
Extra-Judicial Confessions	274
Motive	274

False Explanations and Conduct	274
Injuries on Accused.....	275
Legal Aid and Fair Trial Concerns	275
JUDGMENT-43	276
“Forensic Report Wasn’t Put To Accused”, Allahabad High Court Orders Retrial In Rape-Murder Case, Sets Aside Death Sentence.....	276
Summary of Facts.....	276
Grounds for Re-Trial	276
Issues Raised	277
Contentions raised by Petitioners (Appellant)	277
Contentions raised by Respondents (State).....	277
Judgment of the High Court.....	278
Rationale.....	278
Inference and Analysis	279
JUDGMENT-44	279
Adolf Hitler Was A Vegetarian, Hated Animal Cruelty; Man Cannot Be Judged By Outer Appearance : Madras High Court While Upholding Death Penalty	279
Facts of the Case	279
Question of Law	283
Arguments of the Petitioner (State).....	283
Arguments by the Respondent (Accused)	284
Decision of the Court.....	284
Critical Analysis	285
JUDGMENT-45	286
‘Chances Of Reformation Of Accused Not Ruled Out’, Allahabad High Court Commutes Death Penalty To 30-Year Jail Sans Remission.....	286
Facts in a nutshell.....	286
Issues Raised	287
Contentions raised by Petitioners.....	287
Contentions raised by Respondents.....	289
Judgment of the High Court.....	290
Ratio Decendi.....	291
Inference and Analysis	291
JUDGMENT-46	292
“Murder Was not Pre-Planned Or Pre-Meditated”, Allahabad High Court Commutes Death Sentence.....	292

Facts in nutshell.....	292
Grounds for Special Leave to Appeal	293
Issues Raised	294
Arguments by petitioner (State/Prosecution)	294
Arguments by the Respondent (Convicts / Appellants)	294
Critical analysis	295
JUDGMENT-47	296
Supreme Court Commutes Death Sentence Awarded To A Man Accused Of Rape And Murder Of A Three Year Old Girl Child	296
Facts.....	296
Question of Law	297
Arguments by Petitioner (Accused)	298
Arguments by Respondent (State).....	299
Decision by Court	300
Critical Analysis	301
JUDGMENT-48	303
Prosecution had failed to establish guilt beyond reasonable doubt, No Death Penalty	303
Procedural history.....	303
Background	303
Issues before the Court.....	304
Arguments by the Petitioner	304
Arguments by the Respondents :	305
Ratio and key legal holdings	307
Critical observations and implications for practice	307
JUDGMENT-49	308
Rajasthan High Court Upholds Death Sentence Awarded To Murder Accused.....	308
Facts In a Nutshell.....	308
Issues Raised	308
Contentions Raised by The Appellant	309
Contentions Raised by The Respondent	309
Judgment of Rajasthan High Court	309
Guidelines Issued	310
Rationale	310
Inference & Analysis.....	311

JUDGMENT-50	311
High Court Upholds Death Penalty in ‘Rarest of Rare’ Case for Rape and Murder of a Minor	311
Facts in nutshell.....	311
Grounds for Appeal.....	312
Issues Raised.....	312
Contentions raised by Appellants	313
Contentions raised by State (Respondent)	313
Judgment of the High Court.....	313
Guidelines and Legal Principles Reiterated.....	314
Rationale.....	314
Inference and Analysis	315
Decision by Court	315
JUDGMENT-51	316
Low Age of Rape Victim Is Not Considered as The Only or Sufficient Factor to Impose Death Sentence	316
Facts in Nutshell.....	317
Question of Law	318
Arguments by the Petitioner	319
Arguments by the Respondent	320
Judgment of the Supreme Court.....	321
Critical Analysis	322
JUDGMENT-52	325
State Must Not Defeat Purpose Of Death Sentence By Showing Laxity In Implementation: Supreme Court.....	325
Facts in nutshell.....	325
Issue Raised.....	326
Contentions raised by Appellants	326
Contentions raised by Respondents.....	327
Judgment by the Supreme Court.....	327
Effect of the Judgement.....	327
Defects in the Law.....	328
JUDGMENT-53	329
Rape & Murder of Minor Girl, Karnataka HC Commutes Death Penalty, Sentences Accused To 25 Years’ Rigorous Imprisonment.....	329
Facts in nutshell.....	329
Grounds for Special Leave to Appeal	330

Issues Raised	330
Contentions Raised by Petitioners.....	331
Contentions Raised by Respondents.....	331
Judgement of the Supreme Court.....	332
Trilogy of Judgements: Guidelines Issued	333
Rationale.....	334
JUDGMENT-54	334
Supreme Court Reiterates Scrutiny of Interested Witness Testimonies in Capital Punishment Cases	334
Facts in a Nutshell.....	334
Question of Law	335
Contentions raised by the Appellants	335
Contentions raised by the Prosecution	337
Rationale and Decision of the Court	338
Critical Analysis of the Case	339
Conclusion	341
JUDGMENT-55	341
Gang Rape Of 8 Year Old Girl, Madhya Pradesh High Court Upholds Death Sentence Awarded to Accused Duo	341
Facts of the Case	341
Question of Law	343
Arguments by Petitioner (State/Prosecution)	344
4. Arguments by Respondent (Defense/Appellants)	346
Decision by Court	348
Critical Analysis	349
JUDGMENT-56	351
Bombay High Court Confirms Death Sentence To Man Who Killed Daughter And Unborn Grandchild For Performing Inter-Caste Marriage	351
Facts in nutshell.....	351
Issue Raised.....	352
Contentions raised by Appellants	352
Contentions raised by Respondents.....	352
Judgment by the High Court.....	353
Critical analysis	354
Rationale.....	355
Conclusion	356

JUGDMENT-57	356
Gang Rape and Murder of Minor Girl: Supreme Court confirms	
Death Sentence	356
Facts.....	356
Legal Sections Invoked.....	357
Question of Law	358
Contentions Raised by the Petitioner	358
Contentions Raised by the Respondent.....	359
Judgement	360
Analysis	361
Conclusion	361
JUDGMENT-58	362
‘Shabby Investigation, Laconic Trial’, Supreme Court Acquits Man	
Sentenced To Death In Child Rape-Murder Case.....	362
Facts.....	362
The Legal Framework: Circumstantial Evidence in Indian Jurisprudence	362
Analysis of the Prosecution’s Evidence	363
Conclusion	366
JUDGMENT-59	367
Commutation of Death Sentence	367
Facts.....	367
Grounds for Appeal.....	368
Issues.....	370
Contentions of the Appellant	371
Contentions of the Respondent.....	372
Judgment by High Court	372
Rationale.....	373
Inference & Analysis.....	373
JUDGMENT-60	374
Circumstantial Evidence and the Rarest of Rare Doctrine.....	374
Incident and Background	374
Sequence of Events	374
Investigation and Evidence	374
Major Findings and Forensic Information	375
Questions of Law	375
Arguments advanced by the Accused	376

Arguments advanced by the Victim.....	377
Judgment by the Trial Court	378
Judgment by the High Court.....	379
Rationale.....	380
Inference and Analysis	380
Application of Death Penalty and Its Importance.....	381
Conclusion	381
JUDGMENT-61	382
Lack Of Remorse Doesn't Indicate That There Is No Scope Of Reform: SC Commutes Death Sentence In Kidnap, Rape & Murder Case	382
FACTS	382
Grounds for Special Leave Petition	384
Issues Raised.....	385
Contentions Raised by Petitioner	386
Contentions Raised by Respondent	386
Judgment.....	387
Rationale.....	388
Mitigating and Aggravating Factors	389
Aggravating Factors	389
Mitigating Factors	390
Critical Analysis	390
Conclusion	391
JUDGMENT-62	392
Death Penalty In Gang Rape And Murder Case Of A Mentally Ill Woman	392
Facts in nutshell.....	392
Procedural History.....	393
Question of Law	394
Arguments by Appellants.....	394
Arguments by Respondent.....	395
Decision by the Punjab & Haryana High Court	396
Critical Analysis	397
Conclusion	398
JUDGMENT-63	399
Legislative Recommendation for Capital Punishment in Child Rape Cases	399

Facts of the Case	399
Arguments by Petitioner (State of Uttarakhand).....	400
Arguments by Respondent (Karandeep Sharma @ Razia @ Raju).....	400
Decision by Court	400
Critical Analysis	400
Conclusion	403
JUDGMENT-64	404
Madhya Pradesh High Court Commutes Death Penalty Imposed On Man Convicted For Rape And Murder Of Minor	404
Facts	404
Question of Law	404
Arguments by Petitioner (Appellant)	405
Arguments by Respondent (State).....	406
Grounds for Special Leave to Appeal	406
Trilogy of Judgments (Supreme Court Precedents).....	407
Guidelines Issued by High Court.....	407
Critical Analysis	407
Rationale.....	408
Inference and Analysis	408
Decision by Court	408
Conclusion	409
JUDGMENT-65	409
Trial Court-Imposed Death In Haste Without Full Inquiry Into Mitigating Factors.....	409
Facts in Nutshell.....	409
Question of law	411
Arguments by the Petitioner	412
Argument's by Respondents.....	413
Critical analysis	416
Conclusion	417
JUGDMENT-66	417
High Court Commutes Death Penalty Of Three Convicts In 2013 Shakti Mills Gang Rape of A Photo-Journalist	417
Facts	417
Grounds for Special Leave to Appeal	421
Issues Raised	423

Contentions raised by Petitioners.....	424
Contentions raised by Respondents.....	425
Judgment by Supreme Court	426
Trilogy of Judgements: Guidelines Issued	426
Ratio Decidendi and Obiter Dicta.....	427
Obiter dicta	427
JUDGMENT-67	428
Court underscored the necessity of proportionate punishment in maintaining societal equilibrium	428
Facts In Nutshell.....	428
Question Of Law	428
Contentions By The Petitioner	429
Contentions By The Respondent	429
Judgement Of High Court	430
Rationale	430
Inference And Analysis	431
Conclusion	432
JUDGMENT-68	432
Supreme Court Commutes Death Penalty Awarded To Man Convicted For Murder Of Wife, 4 Kids	432
Facts	432
Question of Law	433
Arguments raised by the Petitioner.....	434
Decision by Court	435
Critical Analysis	436
JUDGMENT-69	437
Allahabad High Court Acquits Man Sentenced to Death by Trial Court.....	437
Facts In A Nutshell.....	437
Issues Before the High Court	438
Contentions Raised By Petitioner.....	439
Contentions Raised By Respondents.....	439
Decision By Court	439
Critical Analysis	440
JUDGMENT-70	441
Constitutional guarantees and evidentiary protections all come together in a case involving the death penalty	441

Facts In A Nutshell.....	441
Question of Law	442
Arguments by Petitioner.....	444
Arguments By Respondent.....	445
Decision by Court	447
Critical Analysis	448
JUDGMENT-71	450
High Court Commutes Death Sentence of 70-Year-Old Convict.....	450
Facts Of The Case.....	450
Questions Of Law	452
Arguments By Petitioner.....	454
Arguments By The Respondent.....	455
Decision By Court	455
Critical Analysis	457
JUDGMENT-72	458
High Court Commutes Death Sentence Of Convict In Rape & Murder Case Of 4½ Years Old Girl.....	458
Facts in a nutshell.....	458
Grounds for Special leave to appeal.....	459
Issues raised	459
Contentions raised by Apellant:	460
Contentions raised by Respondent.....	464
Judgement by the High Court.....	469
Guidelines issued	478
Rationale and Analysis.....	478
JUDGMENT-73	480
High Court Commutes Death Penalty of 26-Year-Old Convicted For Murder, Rape of Minor; Sentences Him To Life Imprisonment	480
Facts in Nutshell.....	480
Grounds/Procedural History.....	481
Issues Raised.....	482
Contentions of Appellant/Petitioner	483
Contentions of Respondent/State	484
Judgment by the Court.....	485
Legal Principles and Guidelines Applied.....	486
Rationale for Decision	487

JUDGMENT-74	488
High Court Commutes Death Sentence of Murder Convict to Life Imprisonment with No Remission For 40 years	488
Facts in Nutshell.....	488
Grounds for Appeal.....	490
Issues.....	491
Question of Law	491
Arguments by the Petitioner	492
Arguments by the Respondent	493
Decision of the Court.....	494
Critical Analysis	494
Rationale	495
JUDGMENT-75	496
High Court Confirms Death Sentence of Two For Minor's Kidnap-Cum-Murder.....	496
Facts in nutshell.....	496
Question of Law	497
Contentions Raised by the Petitioners	498
Contentions Raised by the Respondent/State	500
Decision by the Court.....	503
Critical Analysis	505
JUDGMENT-76	506
Death penalty should remain the exception rather than the rule.....	506
Facts in a Nutshell.....	506
Grounds for Appeal.....	507
Issues Raised	507
Contentions Raised by the Petitioner (Accused)	507
Contentions Raised by Respondent (State)	508
Judgment of High Court	508
Consideration of Death Penalty	508
Rationale.....	509
Inference and Analysis	509
Conclusion	510
JUDGMENT-77	511
High Court Acquits Man Facing Death Penalty In Minor Murder, Rape Case.....	511

Facts in Nutshell.....	511
Grounds for Appeal.....	513
Issues Raised.....	514
Contentions raised by Petitioners.....	515
Contentions raised by Respondents.....	517
Judgement by Allahabad High Court.....	518
Rationale.....	519
JUDGMENT-78	520
High Court Refuses To Commute Death Sentence.....	520
Facts	520
Grounds for Commutation of Death Penalty.....	521
Issues Raised.....	522
Contentions raised by Petitioners.....	523
Contentions raised by Respondents.....	523
Judgement	524
Rationale.....	524
Critical Analysis	525
JUDGMENT-79	525
Taking Note of Law Commission's Recommendation, SC Commutes Death Sentence in Double Murder Case	525
Facts in nutshell.....	525
Grounds for Special Leave to Appeal	525
Issues Raised.....	526
Contentions Raised by the State	526
Contentions Raised by the Respondent.....	526
Judgment.....	527
Rationale.....	527
Inference and Analysis.....	527
Conclusion	528
JUDGMENT-80	528
Irregularities In Reasoning & Appreciation of Evidence by Trial Court: Karnataka High Court Sets Aside Death Penalty of 62 Yr Old in POCSO Case	528
Facts.....	528
Question of law	529
Arguements by Petitioner	529

Arguements by Respondent.....	530
Decision by Court	531
Critical Analysis	532

Chapter-5

DEATH PENALTY FOR RAPE AND MURDER OF MINORs

Who is a Child in India?.....	534
The Protection of Children from Sexual Offences (POCSO) Act, 2012	534
Death Penalty when can it be awarded:	535
Aggravating circumstances - (Crime test)	536
Mitigating Circumstances: (Criminal test)	537
Cases in which Death Penalty is Commuted:	540
Jugdments of Courts.....	547
JUDGMENT-1	547
Young Accused of rape and murder not awarded Death Penalty on account of him being reformed in future.....	547
Facts in Nutshell:.....	547
Decision by Trial Court and High Court:	548
Contention by the learned counsel for the accused:	549
Decision by Supreme Court:.....	549
Post-mortem Report:.....	550
JUDGMENT-2	552
Death Penalty for rape and murder of nine years girl not awarded to accused considering the age of the accused.....	552
Facts in Nutshell:.....	552
Decision by Trial Court:	555
Contention by the learned counsel for the accused before the High Court:	556
Contention by the learned Government Advocate:	557
Aggravating circumstances:	557
Rarest of the rare case:.....	561
Decision by High Court:	561
JUDGMENT-3	563
Ghastly rape and murder of a 10 year Old , Death Penalty Awarded	563
Facts in Nutshell:.....	563
Decision by Trial Court and High Court:	565
Argument by the Appellant counsel before the Supreme Court:	568
Circumstances in which Death Penalty may be awarded:.....	568

Decision by Supreme Court:.....	571
JUDGMENT-4	573
Death Penalty for rape and murder not awarded to accused due to the voluntary approach of the deceased (girl) in going along with accused in a deep forest.....	573
Facts in Nutshell:.....	573
Brief Story:.....	574
Decision by Trial Court:	575
Contention by the learned counsel for the appellant before the High Court:	576
Contention by the learned public prosecutor before the High Court:	577
Decision by High Court:	577
Whether the imposition of death sentence can be confirmed or not:.....	578
JUDGMENT-5	581
For the offence of Gang-rape of 14-year old girl, no penalty for life imprisonment awarded	581
Facts in Nutshell:.....	581
Decision by Trial Judge:	584
Contention by the learned counsel for the appellant:.....	584
Decision by High Court:	586
JUDGMENT-6	589
Sexual assault, molestation and death of 7 years old girls, Death Penalty Awarded	589
Facts in Nutshell:.....	589
The prosecution case in nutshell:.....	592
Post-mortem Report:.....	593
Decision by Trial Court:	594
Contention by the learned counsel for the appellant:.....	594
Contention by the learned Public Prosecutor:	595
Confession Leading to Recovery:	595
Theory of Last Seen together:.....	596
Evidentiary value of the statement of the accused under Section 313, Cr.P.C [Section 351 of BNSS]:	596
Death Penalty:.....	597
Aggravating and Mitigating Circumstances:.....	599
Aggravating circumstances	599
Mitigating circumstances.....	600

Principles.....	600
Decision by High Court:	601
JUDGMENT-7	603
Rape and murder of twelve years old girl by a 31-year married Man, Death Penalty Awarded	603
Facts in Nutshell:.....	603
Decision by Trial Court:	606
Contention by the amicus curiae and appellant counsel before the High Court:.....	606
Contention by Learned Government Advocate:	608
Last Seen theory and Arrest of Accused on the basis of suspicion :	609
What is DNA, the infallibility of identification by DNA profiling and its accuracy with certainty:.....	609
Decision by High Court:	611
Question of Death Sentence to Appellants:.....	612
JUDGMENT-8	615
Deceased raped and murdered by accused, Death Sentence not Awarded.....	615
Facts in Nutshell:.....	615
Decision by Trail Court and High Court:	616
Observation by Supreme Court:	617
Decision by Supreme Court:.....	618
JUDGMENT-9	619
Acquittal of rape and murder accused on the basis of Circumstantial Evidence.....	619
Facts in Nutshell:.....	619
The prosecution story is as follows:	620
Decision by Trial Court and High Court:	620
Report by Post mortem expert:	621
Decision by Supreme Court:.....	622
JUDGMENT-10	623
Kidnapping, rape and murder of 4-year old Girl, Death Penalty Awarded	623
Facts in Nutshell:.....	623
Facts:.....	624
Decision by Trial Court:	626
Contention by the learned counsel for the appellant before the High Court:	626
Contention by the learned public prosecutor:	627
Decision by High Court:	627

Whether the crime committed by the accused is “rarest of rare” case, demanding capital sentence?	627
Aggravating Circumstances:	628
Mitigating Circumstances:	629
JUDGMENT-11	631
Rape and murder of 7 year old child, Death Penalty Awarded	631
Facts in Nutshell:	631
Briefly stated the case of the prosecution is as follows :	632
Decision by Trial Court and High Court:	634
Decision by Supreme Court:	634
Whether the sentence of death imposed upon the appellant by the trial Court for his conviction under 302, IPC [Section 103 of BNS] and confirmed by the High Court should be maintained or not	634
JUDGMENT-12	636
Minor girl of four years was raped and battered to death, Death Penalty awarded	636
Facts in Nutshell:	636
Death Sentence and Judiciary:	638
Cases in which Death Penalty can be awarded:	641
Principles	642
Decision by Supreme Court:	642